

**ROBERT BAER
KATHLEEN CHRISTISON
RICHARD CLARKE
VICKI DIVOLL
PHILIP GIRALDI
MICHAEL GRIMALDI
ARTHUR S. HULNICK
EDWARD R. M. KANE
W. PATRICK LANG
DAVID MACMICHAEL
EUGENE A. MANNING
JOHN E. MARSH
RAY MCGOVERN
GARETH A. SHELLMAN
LEWIS R. SORLEY
STANSFIELD TURNER
AUSTIN YAMADA**

**VINCENT CANNISTRARO
WILLIAM CHRISTISON
RAY CLOSE
GRAHAM FULLER
MELVIN A. GOODMAN
RALPH M. HOCKLEY
LARRY C. JOHNSON
CAMERON LA CLAIR
LYNNE A. LARKIN
TOM MAERTENS
JAMES MARCINKOWSKI
RICHARD MCDERMOTT
DAVID RUPP
JOHN P. SONTAG
ROBERT DAVID STEELE VIVAS
AMB. (RET) PHILIP C. WILCOX, JR.**

December 9, 2005

The Honorable John S. McCain
United States Senate
Washington D.C. 20510

Dear Senator McCain:

We write to express our strong support for your amendment to the Defense Appropriations bill reinforcing the ban on cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment by all US personnel around the world.

As retired professional intelligence experts and interrogators, we understand how vital accurate intelligence is to US efforts to combat terrorist violence by groups like Al Qaeda. We have seen first-hand the central role that human intelligence gathering has played in countering the threats posed by these radical groups operating in the Middle East, South Asia, and other regions, as well as here at home. We are proud to have served our country, and we remain deeply committed to supporting efforts to confront the serious terrorist threats facing the nation.

In our view, the use of torture and other cruelty against those in US custody undermines this fight. Such tactics fail to produce reliable information, risk corrupting the institutions that employ them, and forfeit the ideals that attract others to our nation's cause.

In the public debate over your amendment, some have argued that CIA interrogators should be exempt from the standards of decency and law that guide the actions of our military in battle and reflect our national values. They argue that the US must retain "flexibility" to act outside accepted standards in dealing with hardened enemies, on the presumption that violent and abusive tactics are the best way to successfully interrogate these prisoners. We reject this view.

Carving out authority for the CIA to abuse prisoners in its custody does a disservice to those brave men and women who serve the agency, and increases the risks to their safety in an already dangerous environment. In addition, it is wrong to assume that abusive treatment can be contained within a bureaucracy without corrupting the institution itself. Even where the intention is to limit abusive treatment to only a narrow category of prisoners or circumstances, other governments that have experimented with such “controlled abuse” have found that employment of violent tactics invariably spreads, becoming more the norm than the exception. There are already signs this is happening in our own interrogation practices, with devastating impact to our nation’s reputation.

Those who press for the “flexibility” to abuse prisoners have been willing to forsake both effectiveness and our values as a nation on the misguided belief that abusive treatment will produce vital intelligence. But interrogation in the real world rarely resembles what we see on television or in the movies. Serious efforts to extract intelligence from captured prisoners are not the stuff of television drama. This task requires research, native language skills, and developing sustained relationships with the targets of interrogation. Abusive tactics make developing these relationships more difficult; instead, they tend to induce a subject to tell an interrogator whatever he or she thinks the interrogator wants to hear. Once these barriers are built up, opportunities for obtaining reliable information from a target usually all but disappear, and vital information is permanently lost.

Thankfully, the choice between our values and success against the terrorist enemy is a false one. We must not be seduced by the fiction that adherence to our ideals is what stands between our great nation and the security it deserves. As the President has often repeated, success in the struggle against terrorism requires a firm moral purpose. In this, our values and our national security are aligned. We support your amendment to restore clarity and honor to US interrogation policy. Much depends on the success of your effort.

Sincerely,

ROBERT BAER, former Case Officer, Directorate of Operations, CIA
VINCENT CANNISTRARO, former director of the CIA Counterterrorism Center
KATHLEEN CHRISTISON, former Analyst, Directorate of Intelligence, CIA
WILLIAM CHRISTISON, former National Intelligence Officer and Director, Office of Regional & Political Analysis, CIA
RICHARD CLARKE, former advisor, National Security Council
RAY CLOSE, former Chief of Station Officer, CIA
VICKI DIVOLL, former Assistant General Counsel, CIA
GRAHAM FULLER, former Vice-Chairman of the National Intelligence Council, CIA
MELVIN A. GOODMAN, former Analyst, Directorate of Intelligence, CIA
PHILIP GIRALDI, former Case Officer, Directorate of Operations, CIA
MICHAEL GRIMALDI, former Analyst, Directorate of Intelligence, CIA
RALPH M. HOCKLEY, Col. USA (ret), former intelligence officer
ARTHUR S. HULNICK, former intelligence officer, US Air Force, former CIA
LARRY C. JOHNSON, former Analyst, Directorate of Intelligence, CIA
EDWARD R. M. KANE, former Chief of Station, CIA
CAMERON LA CLAIR, former Executive Officer of Area Division, CIA
W. PATRICK LANG, Col. USA (ret), Chief of DIA Middle East Division, Director Defense Humint Services
LYNNE A. LARKIN, former Case Officer, Directorate of Operations, CIA
DAVID MACMICHAEL, former National Intelligence Council officer, CIA

TOM MAERTENS, former analyst, Intelligence and Research, Department of State
EUGENE A. MANNING, former Analyst, Office of National Estimates, Directorate of Intelligence, and Counterintelligence Center, CIA
JAMES MARCINKOWSKI, former Case Officer, Directorate of Operations, CIA
JOHN E. MARSH, former Case Officer, Directorate of Operations, CIA
RICHARD MCDERMOTT, former Army Counterintelligence Special Agent
RAY MCGOVERN, former Analyst, Directorate of Intelligence, CIA
DAVID RUPP, former Case Officer, Directorate of Operations, CIA
GARETH A. SHELLMAN, former intelligence analyst, U.S. Army Security Agency
JOHN P. SONTAG, former intelligence analyst, CIA and Department of State
LEWIS R. SORLEY, former Director, National Intelligence Emergency Support Office, CIA
ROBERT DAVID STEELE VIVAS, former clandestine officer, CIA
STANSFIELD TURNER, former Director of Central Intelligence
AMB. (RET) PHILIP C. WILCOX, JR., former Ambassador at Large for Counter Terrorism at Department of State
AUSTIN YAMADA, former Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense for Special Operations and Combating Terrorism

Biographies of Signatories

Robert Baer

Robert Baer was a CIA case officer in the Directorate of Operations from 1976 to 1997, where he served in Middle Eastern countries, including Iraq and Lebanon. He resigned from the agency in 1997 and was awarded its Career Intelligence Medal in 1998.

Vincent Cannistraro

Vincent Cannistraro is the former head of the CIA Counterterrorism Center and led the CIA's investigation into the bombing of Pan Am 103. Since leaving the CIA in 1991, he has been a consultant on terrorism and national security issues. Prior to working for the CIA, Mr. Cannistraro was the Special Assistant for Intelligence in the office of the Secretary of Defense from 1987 to 1988, the Director of NSC intelligence from 1984 to 1987, and worked as a clandestine CIA officer in the Middle East, Africa and Europe.

Kathleen Christison

Kathleen Christison served as a political analyst with the CIA from 1966 until 1979. She worked on Vietnam for several years, including five years in Saigon. She then served as an analyst on the Middle East, particularly the Arab-Israeli conflict, for seven years. Since leaving the CIA in 1979, Ms. Christison has written two books: a history of U.S. policymaking on the Palestinian issue entitled *Perceptions of Palestine: Their Influence on U.S. Middle East Policy*, and an analysis of Palestinian-American political thinking entitled *The Wound of Dispossession: Telling the Palestinian Story*.

William Christison

William Christison served in the CIA from 1950 to 1979. He worked as an analyst on Soviet affairs, worked on issues of global nuclear proliferation in the Office of National Estimates, and served in Germany for three years and in Vietnam for over two. In the mid-1970s, he was the National Intelligence Officer for Southeast Asia, South Asia, and Africa. In his final position, he was the Director of the CIA's Office of Regional and Political Analysis. Since retiring in 1979, Mr. Christison has written extensively on the root causes of terrorism and the U.S. drive for global political and economic hegemony.

Richard A. Clarke

Richard A. Clarke has held numerous positions in the U.S. government relating to counterterrorism. He has served as Special Assistant to the President for Combating Terrorism; National [Presidential] Coordinator for Security, Infrastructure Protection, and Counterterrorism; Assistant Secretary of State for Politico-Military Affairs; and Deputy Assistant Secretary of State for Intelligence. He has provided national security advice to presidents from Ronald Reagan to George W. Bush, consulting on issues of intelligence and terrorism, from 1973 to 2003. Clarke's specialties are cyber security, counterterrorism and homeland security. He is the author of the book, *Against All Enemies*. He testified before the National Commission on Terrorist Attacks Upon the United States in 2004.

Ray Close

Ray Close served in the CIA Directorate of Operations from 1951 to 1977. He served 22 years overseas in the Near East and South Asia Division (Lebanon, Egypt, Pakistan, Saudi Arabia). His last post was Chief of Station, Saudi Arabia from 1970 to 1977.

Vicki Divoll

Vicki Divoll was general counsel for the Senate Select Committee on Intelligence from 2001 to 2003. Prior to that, she was assistant general counsel at the CIA from 1995 to 2000.

Graham Fuller

Graham Fuller served 20 years as a CIA operations officer, working in the Middle East and Asia, later as Vice-Chairman of the National Intelligence Council at CIA, with overall responsibility for national level strategic forecasting. After leaving government service he joined RAND Corporation as a Senior Political Scientist for 12 years and wrote widely on geopolitical issues. Since 1990 he has been working as an independent analyst on Middle Eastern affairs, particularly on issues of Islam, ethnicity, democracy, and geopolitics. He has written many books relating to the Middle East, global geopolitics, and religion in politics, including a book on the Geopolitics of Islam and the West, several books on Turkey, one on Iran, and a study of the Arab Shi'a. His most recent book is *The Future of Political Islam*, Palgrave 2003. He is currently an adjunct professor at Simon Fraser University in Vancouver, BC.

Melvin Goodman

Melvin A. Goodman is senior fellow and director of the national security program at the Center for International Policy. He is also a professor of international security studies and chairman of the international relations department at the National War College. He was division chief and senior analyst at the CIA's Office of Soviet Affairs from 1976 to 1986. He was a senior analyst at the State Department's Bureau of Intelligence and Research from 1974 to 1976. He was an intelligence adviser to the Strategic Arms Limitations Talks in Vienna and Washington.

Philip Giraldi

Philip Giraldi is a former CIA Operations officer. He is a counterterrorism specialist who now advises U.S. corporations on security issues. He is currently employed in the private sector but writes a regular column on security issues for *The American Conservative Magazine*.

Michael Grimaldi

Michael Grimaldi served for six years as an analyst in the South American division of the CIA's Directorate of Intelligence. He has been a federal law enforcement intelligence officer since 1993.

Ralph M. Hockley

Ralph Hockley served as a combat artillery officer in the Korean War. From 1952 to 1954, he served as a junior officer in Army Intelligence in the US and Berlin. Mr. Hockley was in the Army Reserve from which he retired in 1979 and was an operations officer of an Army Intelligence operation till August 1977.

Arthur S. Hulnick

Arthur Hulnick is a veteran of more than 35 years in the profession of intelligence, including 7 years as an intelligence officer in the US Air Force and 28 years in the Central Intelligence Agency. He is currently an Associate Professor with the Department of International Relations at Boston University, after beginning there as a CIA Officer-in-Residence in 1989. Mr. Hulnick has published numerous scholarly articles on the subject, as well as the books *Keeping Us Safe: Secret Intelligence and Homeland Security* (2004) and *Fixing the Spy Machine: Preparing American Intelligence for the 21st Century* (1999). He regularly lectures at other universities and colleges on intelligence issues.

Edward R. M. Kane

Edward Kane served in the CIA Directorate of Operations from 1951 to 1982. He served 25 years overseas, in Turkey, Egypt, Iraq, Lebanon, Libya, Senegal, Algeria, and Portugal. His last post was as Chief of Station, Lisbon (1978-82).

Larry C. Johnson

Larry Johnson served as Deputy Director in the U.S. State Department's Office of Counter Terrorism from 1989 to 1993, managing crisis response operations for terrorist incidents throughout the world and helping organize and direct the US Government's debriefing of US citizens held in Kuwait and Iraq, which provided vital intelligence on Iraqi operations following the 1990 invasion of Kuwait. Mr. Johnson also participated in the investigation of the terrorist bombing of Pan Am 103. From 1985 to 1989, Mr. Johnson worked for the Central Intelligence Agency. He received training in paramilitary operations, worked in the Directorate of Operations and served in the CIA's Operation's Center, establishing himself as a prolific analyst in the Directorate of Intelligence. He received two Exceptional Performance Awards.

Cameron La Clair

Cameron La Clair served in various intelligence posts in Geneva, Paris, Frankfurt, Milan, Vietnam, and London. He also served as executive officer of an area division in the CIA's Directorate of Operations.

Lynne A. Larkin

Lynne Larkin is a former CIA Operations officer. She worked overseas in several CIA stations, and she worked for two years in the counter-intelligence center in the CIA helping chair a multi-agency task force and seminars on coordinating intelligence among intelligence and crime prevention agencies. She also worked for three years in the CIA policy coordination staff ensuring adherence to law and policy in all CIA operations. She is currently an attorney in the private sector, and is actively involved in securing

whistle-blower protections for members of the national security intelligence community, lobbying and litigating to that end. She has her own legal practice in Florida.

W. Patrick Lang

Patrick Lang is a retired senior officer of U.S. Military Intelligence and U.S. Army Special Forces. He is a highly decorated veteran of several of America's overseas conflicts including the war in Vietnam. He was trained and educated as a specialist in the Middle East by the U.S. Army and served in that region for many years. In the Defense Intelligence Agency (DIA) he was the Defense Intelligence Officer for the Middle East, South Asia and Terrorism, and later the first Director of the Defense HUMINT Service. At the DIA, he was a member of the Defense Senior Executive Service and was awarded the "Presidential Rank of Distinguished Executive."

David MacMichael

David MacMichael, a former Marine and historian, spent many years as a consultant to U.S. government agencies. He was a senior estimates officer with special responsibility for Western Hemisphere Affairs at the CIA's National Intelligence Council from 1981 to 1983. He is a Foreign Policy In Focus analyst and a steering committee member of Veteran Intelligence Professionals for Sanity (VIPS).

Tom Maertens

Tom Maertens is a retired Foreign Service Officer who served three tours as an intelligence analyst in the Department of State, served as NSC Director for nonproliferation under Presidents Clinton and Bush, and as Deputy Coordinator for Counterterrorism in the Department of State during and after the events of September 11, 2001.

Eugene A. Manning

Dr. Eugene Manning was the principal drafter of numerous national intelligence estimates on Southeast Asia outside of Indochina from 1967 to 1972. He did political research on questions about European unity and support for NATO from 1974 to 1976 and the full range of analysis on southern Africa from 1977 to 1985. He also served as an editor on the National Intelligence Daily and briefly on the National Intelligence Council. He analyzed various foreign intelligence services at the CIA's Counterintelligence Center from 1989 through 1992.

James Marcinkowski

James Marcinkowski joined the CIA after serving in the navy and earning his J.D. He was an undercover case officer posted with the Agency's Central American Task Force as the Iran Contra scandal unfolded. Mr. Marcinkowski is now a deputy city attorney in Royal Oak, Michigan, and has testified before a closed session of the Senate Intelligence Committee on the concept of "plausible deniability."

John E. Marsh

John Marsh served in the CIA Directorate of Operations from 1950 to 1974. Mr. Marsh served 14 years overseas in the Near East and South Asia Division (India, Jordan, Ceylon, Kuwait, Lebanon, Cyprus).

Richard McDermott

Richard McDermott is a former Army Counterintelligence Special Agent, Military Intelligence Company Commander, and Intelligence Research Officer, DIA.

Ray McGovern

Ray McGovern's 27-year career as a CIA analyst spanned administrations from John F. Kennedy to George H. W. Bush. His duties at CIA included chairing National Intelligence Estimates, preparing the President's Daily Brief, and conducting the morning PDB briefings. Mr. McGovern was awarded the Intelligence Commendation Medal upon his retirement. In January 2003, Mr. McGovern joined with a handful of intelligence community alumni to create Veteran Intelligence Professionals for Sanity. VIPS now includes 52 former intelligence officers from CIA, the Defense Intelligence Agency, the Department of State's Bureau of Intelligence and Research, the FBI, the National Security Agency, and Army, Navy, and Air Force intelligence units.

David Rupp

Mr. Rupp is a retired CIA case officer (1963-1990), with service in Europe, Vietnam, and as chief of station in two African countries.

Gareth A. Shellman

Gareth Shellman was a former intelligence analyst for the U.S. Army Security Agency HQ Europe.

John P. Sontag

John Sontag was an analyst for 34 years on Soviet and Chinese affairs in the Directorate of Intelligence, CIA, and the Bureau of Intelligence and Research, Department of State.

Lewis R. Sorley

Lewis Sorley served in the CIA as Director of the National Intelligence Emergency Support Office. In addition he was chief of Policy and Plans Division, Intelligence Community Staff, 1976-78 and served as senior inspector, Office of the Inspector General, 1978-79. Prior to his service in the CIA Mr. Sorley was a career officer in the U.S. Army from 1956 to 1976. During that period he served as assistant secretary of general staff, in the Office of the Chief of Staff, 1968-70, and as senior military assistant to director of net assessment, Office of the Secretary of Defense, 1975-76, finally retiring as lieutenant colonel. Mr. Sorley is a member of the advisory council of Defense Intelligence College and an international consultant on public policy issues, concentrating on national security matters.

Robert David Steele Vivas

Robert David Steele Vivas is a former CIA clandestine officer. One of the first assigned terrorism as a full-time target in the 1980s, he has served as a Marine Corps infantry officer and service-level plans officer; fulfilled clandestine, covert action, and technical collection duties. He is the author of *ON INTELLIGENCE: Spies and Secrecy in an Open World* (AFCEA, 2000, Foreword by Senator David Boren (D-OK)), and *The New Craft of Intelligence: Personal, Public, & Political* (OSS, 2002, Foreword by Senator Pat Roberts (R-KS)); and editor as well as publisher of *PEACEKEEPING INTELLIGENCE: Emerging Concepts for the Future* (OSS, 2003, Foreword by Dame Pauline Neville-Jones, UK). He is the founder and CEO of OSS.Net, a Global Intelligence Partnership and network that teaches and performs legal ethical intelligence collection, processing, and analysis.

Stansfield Turner

Admiral Stansfield Turner was Director of Central Intelligence from 1977 to 1981. He served as Commander in Chief, Allied Forces Southern Europe (NATO), and Commander, US Second Fleet. He was President of the Naval War College from 1972 to 1974.

Amb. (ret) Philip C. Wilcox, Jr.

Ambassador Philip Wilcox was Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary of State for Intelligence and Research, 1991-94, and Ambassador at Large for Counter Terrorism at State, 1994-1997. He is now President of the Foundation for Middle East Peace.

Austin Yamada

Austin Yamada served for 25 years as a career member of the Civil Service in the Department of Defense, most recently, as Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense for Special Operations and Combating Terrorism in the Office of the Secretary of Defense, where he was responsible for oversight of the United States Special Operations Command and the counterterrorism operations of the Department of Defense. Mr. Yamada received numerous awards for his performance, including the Presidential Rank of Meritorious Executive in the Senior Executive Service. He also served as Director of the Special Advisory Staff where he was responsible for oversight and coordination of Special Reconnaissance Operations and management of the Defense Sensitive Support Office.